

sermons, such as Mary Morissey's *Politics and the Paul's Cross Sermons, 1558–1642* (2011), and as contributing editor to *Sermons at Paul's Cross, 1521–1642* (2017), gen. ed. T. Kirby (with P.G. Stanwood and John King), a unique collection of significant sermon texts—in the brief bibliography, this textual edition appears falsely among secondary sources. *In the Shadow of St Paul's Cathedral* is attractively printed, with many excellent illustrations and an inserted section of fine color plates. This is an ambitious book that has nothing to prove but an engaging story to tell; its incidents are intelligently selected, and the result is a highly condensed history presented in an appealing way.

Chris R. Langley, Catherine E. McMillan, and Russell Newton, eds. *The Clergy in Early Modern Scotland*. Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2021. xviii + 270 pp. + 2 illus. \$99.00. Review by NEWTON KEY, EASTERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY.

From the pulpit to the pew and back again. The editors introduce this collection by noting historians' changing agenda for studying the first centuries of the Reformed Church in Scotland. A series of biographies and collected works of individual Scots clergy gave way to collective studies which highlighted clerical administration and finances, but historians despaired of using the resulting statistics to trace motives. Clergy were reduced to a "walk-on role" (4) regarding the Reformation's impact. Instead, a revolution in Scottish Reformation studies a quarter of a century ago—notably Michael F. Graham's *The Uses of Reform: "Godly Discipline" and Popular Behaviour in Scotland and Beyond, 1560–1610* (1997) and Margo Todd's *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland* (2003)—turned to parishioners' ideas and activities, that is, the bounds of lay religion. Only in the past decade has work, including that by several contributors to this volume, been redirected to sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Scots clergy. See, for example, the online clergy prosopographical project, Mapping the Scottish Reformation <https://mappingthescottishreformation.org/> initiated in 2017 and co-directed by contributors Chris Langley and Michelle Brock.

The essays in the collection are divided into two sections: Themes, which draw from evidence across Scotland, and Case Studies, which focus on individual types of evidence, clergy, parishes, or regions. In Themes, Brock examines sermons, parishioners' notes, and manuals to reveal the clerical ideal. What were the expectations placed on the cleric in his parish? Convincing preaching was one, and surviving sermon notes remind us that many parishioners listened pen in hand. One parishioner newly relocated to the northern Highlands bemoaned being surrounded by "legal lifeless sermons" (26) compared to those of the A-list, Edinburgh preachers he heard previously. Clergy realized their own human limits and that "expectations had to be managed" (30). Also needing managing were parishioners' duties and activities, and ministers had to walk a fine line between being both part of the covenanting people and making sure others honored the covenant. Russell Newton turns to the various ways the early modern Scots ministry used the Bible. For example, one seventeenth-century cleric led his family exercises by *singing* a Psalm, *reading* Scripture, *discoursing* about that, then *praying* from it. Clergy engaged in Bible study with parishioners or drew from it to counsel them and worked with other ministers to present a common public interpretation of the Bible. John McCallum's and Helen Gair's study of clergy and poor relief also reveals the collaborative nature of early modern clergy, in this case sharing work and goals with their parishioners. They question the view that a minister's role in shaping relief was limited to his individual vote, the same as an elder or deacon. Status and the power of the pulpit, they suggest, ensured rather more influence. Janay Nugent and L. Rae Stouffer attempt to uncover the mainly hidden lives of ministers' families. A shortfall of ministers before the 1620s made the available clergy necessarily peripatetic, sharing parishes and helping others. As a result, the "home" parish in effect was served at times by the minister's wife or even his daughter. And being at the wrong end of seventeenth-century religio-political shifts could cause hardships for ministers' families, exemplified by those orphaned when their father was incarcerated. The authors carefully navigate the available evidence and suggest avenues of future research. Langley's chapter on anticlericalism places seventeenth-century Scotland in a wider, continental context. Prevailing research has doubted whether anticlericalism was

an agent for change, though some scholars reintroduce the concept as a consequence of change. Although visitation records reveal more local disputes than clear anticlericalism, and, indeed, become increasingly formulaic over the period, parishioners' complaints about their minister do reveal expectations about clerical behavior. Complaints about external clerical representatives also reveal suspicion of outsiders, reminding one of the hatred against the *intrus* in the bocage region of France shown during the *Vendée* over a century later.

The essays in the Case Studies section provide exciting if exacting evidence for the larger picture. Elizabeth Tapscott notes how itinerants not parish clergy made the earliest calls for parochial reform. Printed calls for reform made "appeals to ever-larger circles" (128) from the academy, to the court, and, finally, to the nobility and wider public. Michael Graham's intricate study of the pulpit politics of St. Andrews in the 1590s shows the interplay of local and national affairs. Factions split over control of the pulpit. By the time the session felt it needed to specify that "no one should appear on the stool of repentance armed" (139), the split was clearly edging towards conflict and tumult. In 1596, when one minister preached that Queen Elizabeth "was an atheist" (141), the Court and James VI took more than a passing interest in local affairs. Ultimately, the burgh reasserted control over the kirk, and both could be used as the local arm of kingly government. If St. Andrews was tightly intertwined with central authority, the Orkney archipelago was distant from both the central Church and State. Peter Marshall draws from his current research on early modern Orkney, and shows the interaction of local, national, and even international religious currents. One seventeenth-century writer noted the islands conduct "ecclesiastical business as in Scotland" (155), suggesting the mainland was another country. Orkney ministers, necessarily trained and often from elsewhere, acted like Carlo Ginzburg's inquisitor, as "interpreters and ethnographers of the world they encountered" (156). Marshall compiles the number of outsiders versus insiders appointed (again, we might think of the Vendean *intrus*): Orkney-born ministers ranged from of twelve percent (1600-39) to nearly thirty-one percent appointed (1720-59). Even these, given there were a couple dozen inhabited islands, practiced a degree of island and parish hopping over any one career. At least one early modern minister was slandered as a

“ferry looper” (166), or outsider. Perhaps in response to local suspicions and outsider misunderstandings, the Orkney ministers formed a close-knit community. Claire McNulty’s examines James Sharpe’s reforming of South Leith from his appointment there in 1639 until his death six years later. Why were the South Leith parishioners and the patron of the parish, covenanting magnate Lord Balmerino, so keen to ensure Sharpe’s appointment and override the reluctance of the assembly from which he came? Given his actions, we must assume a local desire for moral discipline, as Sharpe quickly “sent elders into the streets to listen...and to report indiscretions” (179)! Surely no one would have been surprised to discover swearing and blasphemy among the sailors and dockworkers of Scotland’s busiest port. But records show increasing reports of “fornication under promise of marriage” (182), and Sharpe appears to have strived to enforce marriage bans and limit children out of wedlock. John Dury’s pastoral experience is examined by Felicity Lyn Maxwell for roughly the same period as Sharpe is by McNulty. But Maxwell can illuminate Dury’s personal life because correspondence survives regarding his courtship and eventual marriage to the well-educated widow, Dorothy Moore, from whom he arguably drew support and advice. Moore’s experience in less than five years from 1641 was peripatetic and international: a rector for an English parish, chaplain to the Princess Royal at The Hague, and minister to the Merchant Adventurers in Rotterdam. Through family exile and education he lived as “a Scottish clergyman abroad” (188), but he wrote widely and saw himself as a public intellectual influencing courts and nobles across nations as well as his own parishioners. The preaching of Hugh Binning in the mid-seventeenth century serves as the case for Nathan C.J. Hood’s study. Hood’s chapter contributes to the history of emotion, specifically the emotionalism of Scottish Protestantism. Binning attempted to moderate that emotional religious chord, urging and practicing restraint.

This collection concludes with an afterword by Jane Dawson who draws upon each of the preceding chapters and her own work (and a couple of images of clerical garments) to outline the transformation in the preaching and ministry of Reformation Scotland between 1500 and 1700. Overall, these chapters harvest rich details of the everyday lives of the early modern clergy and their collaboration

with their parishioners. The “qualitative approach” (234) embraced here demonstrates such success regarding the clergy’s *agency* that a return to counting clergy to revise our sense of the Church’s *structure* might be useful too in future. The editors are quick to admit that pieces here focus on the Protestant clergy, and that more work is needed on their Scottish Catholic counterparts. One might add work needed on would-be preachers—readers, chaplains, teachers, even clerks—to flesh out the life- or career-cycle of many parish clergy, though admittedly evidence for these are scant. The introductory historiography, various approaches, and combined bibliography might make this collection serve as a *vade mecum* to such future studies of the early modern Scottish Church.

Chakravarty Urvashi. *Fictions of Consent: Slavery, Servitude, and Free Service in Early Modern England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2022. xiv + 295 pp. \$65. Review by RAY BOSSERT, INDEPENDENT SCHOLAR.

Early modern political polemics often relied on the trope of England as a nation of free persons, intolerant of slavery on its home island; but in what ways did English culture and society contradict this national self-image? And how might those structures, submerged under rhetoric of freedom, have contributed to the evolution of racialized human trafficking and trans-atlantic slavery? Urvashi Chakravarty probes these questions in *Fictions of Consent: Slavery, Servitude, and Free Service in Early Modern England*—a monograph that rewards the reader with essential concepts, unexpected evidence, and thought-provoking analysis.

Servants in early modern England wanted their role in the class system to be compatible with a belief that they still retained their native freedom as Englishmen. The title of the book points to ways English lawyers, dramatists, and others attempted to demonstrate that compatibility by distinguishing between a servant’s freedom and a slave’s bondage. Chakravarty argues these attempts are “fictions” by way of Derridean deconstruction. For Chakravarty, social conditions, slipperiness of language, and even illiteracy all undermine efforts to