REVIEWS 25

verse and far-reaching the influence of Du Bartas has been in Britain compared to Catholic France, where the memory of the Protestant Du Bartas was wiped out with the rise of French Classicism. The chapter also shows that there are still many avenues to explore. Auger is well aware of this (227): he indicates that further comparative reception research in Britain and contemporary Europe is a desideratum—Auger's book provides a good starting point for this. Another line of research he indicates is the relationship between Devine Weekes and emblem books. Both avenues could be nicely combined and extrapolated to the relationships with the visual arts in general: why are the British Du Bartas translations not illustrated, while several French and Dutch editions are? And returning to Mary Roper, the question of her use of existing illustrations is not addressed by Auger in his book, but it is in the aforementioned article by his hand. There are also avenues not mentioned by Auger: for example, Du Bartas' reception can now be further explored using MEDIATE, a recently developed database that provides access to a large number of digitized and searchable French, German, British and Dutch private library auction catalogues from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries (https://mediater8.nl/?page=home). And finally, a question that personally intrigues me: what is the role of references to Du Bartas in British natural history? It is remarkable, for instance, that a number of Auger's examples relate specifically to ichthyology: quoted are some anonymous readers interested in fish (65, 120) and Izaak Walton, author of the well-known Compleat Angler (210). In short, Auger's compelling study, both scholarly and accessible, opens many doors to future research.

Abram C. Van Engen. *City on the Hill: A History of American Exceptionalism*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2020. ix + 379 pp. \$32.00. Review by WILLIAM J. SCHEICK, UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN.

Abram C. Van Engen compellingly probes the murky American canonization of a segment of *A Model of Christian Charity*, a 1630 sermon by John Winthrop. A mystery of sorts unfolds as Van Engen turns from surprising facts about the extant manuscript to nineteenth-

century collectors of this document, and then to twentieth-century historians' and politicians' increasing distortions of the meaning of this document.

Van Engen's revelations about the manuscript are sobering. It is a copy, not Winthrop's original. Its first two long sections are missing, presumably lost forever. The absence of these portions, informed by a distinctive Geneva Bible context, has unfortunately enabled latter-day misreadings of the sermon. The manuscript shows, as well, tinkering by other hands.

Equally sobering, Van Engen reveals that this sermon apparently left no lasting impression during Winthrop's time. In fact, it fell into obscurity for two hundred years. Only during the nineteenth century was the sermon (albeit not recognized as incomplete) recovered by Jeremy Belknap, Ebenezer Hazard and John Pintard)—regionally and religiously motivated archivists hoping to preserve Puritan history. Yet, even for them, Winthrop's sermon was little more than just another document added to the record.

In the flux of American culture so much gets cooptated, inverted or twisted inside-out. Van Engen deftly exposes another example of this phenomenon. During the Cold War, Winthrop's religious conception of freedom (expressed in the *Arabella* sermon) was antithetically contorted into a secular celebration of free enterprise. Likewise, during the Cold War important distinctions between the Pilgrims and the Puritans disappeared. The factuality of diverse American settlements morphed into a single, semi-imaginary New England place seemingly providing a stable, authenticating point of national origin.

Before the Pilgrims in Plymouth and the later Puritans in Boston, there were Englishmen in Jamestown, not to mention Spaniards in St. Augustine and Frenchmen in Quebec. Although American culture yearns for a higher principle than profit and greed for its origin narrative—and concocts an ideal start unsupported by actual New World events—it never escapes the bedrock of its economic foundational beginnings, including slavery.

As the Mayflower Compact gave way to Winthrop's *Arabella* sermon in the American effort to identify an authenticating high principle, distortions proliferated. With a clear Biblical context in mind, Winthrop emphasized a divinely ordained social hierarchy, communal

REVIEWS 27

order, and financial interaction based on Christian charity. His allusion to a city on the hill (from the Sermon of the Mount) relied on Roman Catholic and Protestant precedents. He mentioned it simply in passing and so did not imply any new, specifically foundational meaning. Winthrop's vision featured only communal wellbeing, not individual enterprise.

Even so, as Van Engen convincingly shows, twentieth-century historians and politicians alike transformed that allusion into a politically useful trope. This relatively recent corruption of the manuscript, as it were, elevated Winthrop's once forgotten sermon into a document of national importance. In that document, defenders of American exceptionalism have found an authenticating point of origin that, it turns out, is just a mirage.

Reiner Smolinski and Kenneth P. Minkema, eds. *A Cotton Mather Reader*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2022. xxxvi + 392 pp. \$80.00 (hardcover); \$25.00 (paperback). Review by WILLIAM J. SCHEICK, UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN.

In their introduction to wide-ranging selections from published works and manuscripts, Reiner Smolinski and Kenneth P. Minkema make no bones about their conviction that Cotton Mather "was the foremost scholar and innovative thinker of his generation in New England." They aim to biographically and historically resuscitate a reputation long defamed by pejoratively portrayed caricatures.

The trouble started during this Puritan minister's lifetime, with one disgruntled former parishioner even mockingly naming his dog Cotton Mather. Mather's entanglement in the tragically lethal persecution of Quakers and alleged witches remains well-known, and there were new-charter government warrants for his arrest on the charge of sedition.

On the other hand, Mather had plenty of local support. Some members of his church, for instance, paid printers to publish their pastor's sermons. Often, too, Boston printers bared the cost themselves whenever they surmised that profits could be made from Mather's sermons already popular among his parishioners.