

that Descartes should not be reduced to his very scholastic *Discours de la méthode*. After all, the founder of rationalism also composed *Les passions de l'âme*. Yet this text, which the Enlightenment would have done well to ponder more carefully before trying to reinvent the wheel, continues to remain conspicuously absent from a few too many of our contemporary studies on modern identity A path for future researchers in proto-feminism, maybe?

In short, Theresa Varney Kennedy's *Women's Deliberation* should be treated as an invaluable resource for scholars in early modern theater as well as for researchers in women's literary studies. It is impeccably written and flawlessly edited, and a must-read for the more encyclopedic readers.

Bruce Edelstein and Davide Gasparotto, eds. *Miraculous Encounters: Pontormo from Drawing to Painting*. Los Angeles: J. Paul Getty Museum, 2018. 160 pp. + 60 color illustrations. \$40.00. Review by LIVIA STOENESCU, TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY.

The talent of Jacopo da Pontormo (1494–1557) will never cease to attract expert attention, but the J. Paul Getty Museum has set up a significant precedent with this exhibition catalogue. *Miraculous Encounters: Pontormo from Drawing to Painting* includes new research on the main theme of the exhibition *Pontormo: Miraculous Encounters* held at the Getty Museum in spring 2019, previously shown at the Uffizi and at the Morgan Library & Museum in New York. To underscore the exhibition, the J. Paul Getty Museum additionally organized the international conference *Pontormo: Painting in an Age of Anxiety*, in partnership with the Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies at UCLA.

The catalogue fosters one of Pontormo's great masterpieces, the *Visitation*, an unprecedented loan from the parish church of Santi Michele e Francesco in Carmignano (Prato, Italy), alongside the Getty's own iconic *Portrait of a Halberdier* and the recently rediscovered *Portrait of a Young Man with a Red Cap*, not seen in Italy for more than two centuries and featured now in the United States for the first time. The editors, Bruce Edelstein and Davide Gasparotto,

reunite these major paintings from the artist's maturity with surviving preparatory studies and related drawings, shedding light on the artistic process of Pontormo and the significance of his technique. The catalogue brings together the voices of art historians and conservators who contribute individual chapters about the historical context of the last Florence republic and the dramatic siege of the city. Pontormo's works of maturity, executed between 1528 and 1530, witnessed these implicational events. Remarkably, the catalogue intersperses Florentine history with the new findings regarding Pontormo's drawing and painting techniques, which serve as the basis for reconstructing his original creative process. The chapters also draw on the controversial identification of the sitters of his portraits, especially the debate surrounding the *Halberdier* (c. 1529–30), as well as on the collaboration between Pontormo and his most talented student, Bronzino. These topics are rich in discussions of broader questions of attribution and connoisseurship.

Bruce Edelstein draws on the misinterpretation of Pontormo's image in Vasari's *Life of the artist* (1568). Vasari, at the time promoted to the title as principal court painter, framed his rival Pontormo as a mere eccentric and ignored the *Visitation* perhaps because this particular painting was produced for the anti-Medici supporters of the last Florentine republic (18). In fact, the *Visitation* deeply resonates with Florentine art and evolves the embrace of Mary and Elizabeth from the mosaic representing the *Visitation* scene on the vault of the Baptistery in Florence. Also derived from the Florentine art environment are Pontormo's adaptations from his teacher, Mariotto Albertinelli, whose visual precedent and prototypes for the depictions of the Virgin and Child offered competitive solutions. These Florentine prototypes reflected on the text of the Scripture available in the city's traditions, lending themselves to emulation by Pontormo and younger artists (26). Another peculiarity of the Florentine cult of the *Visitation* was the special consideration shown to the cult of the Baptist. To exemplify the importance of the Baptist in local devotion, Elizabeth was portrayed not bowing in reverence to her cousin, but rather embracing Mary while the two women appear to have the same height in the painting.

Pontormo's *Halberdier* has provoked a series of debates regarding the identity of the sitter, several voices leaning towards associating the

portrait with Francesco Guardi whereas others arguing that the image is a portrait of Duke Cosimo I. Edelstein recapitulates the existing conclusions, but at the same time underscores that no contemporary evidence leads to the statement that the *Halberdier* should be recognized as a true image of the Duke (39). A new idea to emerge is that Pontormo's art of portraiture was guided by the most advanced directions of the Italian Renaissance art. Pontormo culled from Venetian art, especially from Titian's and Sebastiano del Piombo's portraits. Titian led the way and influenced Raphael's own understanding of central Italian portraiture, prompting in turn the younger Pontormo to adopt the open brushwork (39).

Cristina Gnoni Mavarelli's chapter is rich in details on the securement of the loan for the *Visitation* from the church of the Pieve dei Santi Michele e Francesco in Carmignano, where, after the exhibition ended, the *Visitation* was reinstalled using a new system to improve the legibility of the work and to protect by anti-reflective glass (63). The discussions of restorations, techniques, and discoveries have captivated the attention of specialists with always-new findings on the topics at hand. Daniele Rossi's chapter on the restoration of the Carmignano's *Visitation* provides interesting data on the painting. We learn that Pontormo used the female figures to advance his "original invention to increase the relief of his figures." It is widely recognized that Pontormo perfected the art of portraiture in Florence in most original ways, but less attention has been paid to his pictorial technique to date. The realization that his brushwork extracts the portrait from "thick, free-hand strokes of lead white and cinnabar using a flat brush" is revealing. The uncanny nature of Pontormo's portraits becomes fully intelligible when access to his sophisticated technique explains his working process as a deliberate effort at "producing the effect of thin flame-like strokes of red light" (15).

No less impressive are the catalogue entries. Michele Grasso examines the drawing for the *Visitation*, confirming that the artist did not use a cartoon, but instead transferred the drawing to the panel by employing a grid identical to the drawing. Pontormo contributed to Benedetto Varchi's *paragone* a most original position, arguing that sculpture, not painting, holds the leading role in the competing claims of the two sister's arts. While Pontormo's argument may have

confused his audiences given his well-established practice as a painter, his words in praise of sculpture seem important to the idiosyncrasies of his pictorial technique. Pontormo concerned himself with imbuing his subjects with life and exceeded the imitation of nature “in wanting to give spirit to a figure and make it seem alive and [...] in two dimensions.” The theoretical and curatorial positions included in this catalogue, alongside the commentaries, impeccable illustrations, and notes give this J. Paul Getty Museum project an outstanding quality and purpose for scholars, students, and various readers alike.

Felipe Pereda. *Crime and Illusion: The Art of Truth in the Spanish Golden Age*, trans. Consuelo López-Morillas. London/Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2018. 288 pp. + 127 illus. \$151.25. Review by LIVIA STOENESCU, TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY.

The interest in Early Modern Spain has overturned the single-minded pursuit of Italian Renaissance culture in recent years, now taking a significant step forward with Felipe Pereda’s lavishly illustrated book. Before Pereda, contributions have highlighted patrons and important painters of the Spanish Golden Age, expanding and shedding new light on seminal texts by Jonathan Brown, Richard Kagan, and especially Fernando Marías. Felipe Pereda takes a comprehensive view at art historical, religious, political and social issues in an admirable, highly commendable undertaking to remind us that art history belongs to the history of ideas, just as the Vienna School had once attempted to orient the discipline with the assistance, among others, of Max Dvorak’s *Geistesgeschichte*.

The nine chapters of Pereda’s book gravitate around the main idea of “faith and doubt” as a peculiarity of Spanish culture and devotional thought. Pereda interprets the paradox of illusion through associations with Spanish literature and beyond, in the abstruse realm of religious images that exploit illusion and express it through the poetic formula of *engaño* (deceit) versus *desengaño* (undecit). Chapter 1 sets out the main concepts, delineating Pereda’s original methodology: to analyze Spanish Baroque art amounts to taking a forensic approach to images as testimonial proof while recognizing the viewer’s