vital insight into the politics of medical authority and the clash between Eurocentric and indigenous approaches to healing in Latin America. Clark’s essay offers a fitting conclusion to this volume, because it not only illuminates the ways in which politics, ethnicity, and culture coalesced in early modern medical trials, but also lays the groundwork for further comparative work in the history of early modern medicine that has heretofore been largely overlooked. *Ireland and Medicine* does not purport to be a comprehensive survey and may on some levels, pose more questions than it answers about the nature of occupational boundaries between midwives, apothecaries, and physicians, but it makes a compelling case for the autonomy and vitality of early modern Irish medicine that will undoubtedly be of great interest to British historians in general, and medical historians in particular.


John L. Kessell’s history of seventeenth-century New Mexico examines the relationship between the Pueblo Indians and the Spanish settlers, including government, military, and church officials. Kessell’s decision to relate this history through a narrative mode helps elucidate the everyday lives and conflicts among these groups of people. Describing these communities as having coexisted vigorously for over four hundred years, Kessell proposes to present a history of this region that looks beyond stereotypes and myths through his weaving together of analysis and interpretation. Presenting a balanced history of the region is especially challenging, as Kessell notes in his preface, because the existing documentary and archival evidence overwhelmingly provides more of the Spaniards’ experiences than that of the Pueblos’, much less their story told in their own language. Kessell’s attempts to meet this challenge, unfortunately, are not consistent in the text itself.

The introduction, “Conflict and Coexistence,” establishes the tone that Kessell strives for in the book. The Spaniards arrived in the Pueblo world, soon to be renamed New Mexico, in 1598. The Pueb-
los, having occupied the area as far back as two thousand years ago, gradually shifted their nomadic existence to a more sedentary one. The Spaniards’ hope for both monetary and missionary gains in the region often worked at cross-purposes. The Pueblo Indians responded with both cooperation and defiance, most notably the 1680 Pueblo revolt. Chapter 1, “The Pueblo World,” begins with a description of the Pueblo universe centered on corn and the natural world, organized by smaller clans and larger “moities” (11), and alternatively peaceful and warlike. The arrival of the Spanish expedition led by Francisco Vásquez de Coronado in the 1540s is told through the eyes of one of his soldiers, Juan Troyano, a method that Kessell will use in later chapters. Troyano’s testimony as to the savage treatment of the Pueblo delegation sent as envoys to Coronado’s expedition helps explain the Pueblos’ uneasiness at the Spaniards’ renewed attempts in the 1590s to settle the area under Juan de Oñate. Oñate’s first attempts are described in Chapter 2, “Spaniards Come to Stay,” including the notorious Acoma battle of 1599. As punishment to the Acomas’ attack, Oñate ordered the severing of one foot of each of adult Acoma male prisoners along with bound servitude, a punishment also shared by the women and remaining young men of the tribe. Here, Kessel argues a point that has received criticism among his fellow scholars (as he acknowledges in his footnotes): the documentary records only indicate that such punishments occurred without providing further details, and later records are ambiguous in relating the events as well. However, by suggesting that these amputations may not have occurred, Kessell has forgotten his own caveat from the introduction. Why would official attention be paid in Spanish records to the status of disfigured slaves who had been seen as traitors to the crown? His close reading of the Spanish court documents, while offering important insights into the Pueblo world, cannot replace, nor should it cast doubt upon, the oral history and collective memory of the Pueblo people concerning the Acoma tragedy.

Chapter 3, “A Franciscan City of God on the Rio Grande, 1610s-1640s,” discusses the continued evangelization efforts by the Franciscans, including Fray Alonso de Benavides, whose detailed records provide much insight into the lives of the Pueblo Indians with perhaps his own exaggerated accounts of his successes in converting them.
Such inflated reporting, Kessell argues, may be the result of the need to demonstrate their mission’s value in order to continue receiving funding from Spain. Such linking of religious and political agendas in the settlement of the New Mexico area was often tenacious. Chapter 4, “A Colony of Cousins, 1630’s-1660s,” examines this contentious relationship even further as the Franciscan friars exercised their power as agents of the Inquisition in charges brought against various government officials. Kessell also describes the further conversion of the Pueblo Indians to Christianity, one that was challenged by the continued undercover initiation and training of Pueblo children in the native religious practices. Chapter 5, “Troublous Times, 1660s-1670s,” recounts the growing unrest among Pueblo Indians against the Spanish government and missionaries, especially in light of the decade’s drought and Apache attacks. As many Pueblos, such as don Esteban Clemente, had been baptized or converted to Christianity and thus became Spanish allies, they also renounced their kachina religion. Blaming the rough conditions of the times on this betrayal and a failure of the new religion and government to change such conditions, Clemente and other leaders began small rebellions. Clemente was tried and hanged for his crimes, but other leaders followed. Kessell notes that documentary records of Clemente’s plan do not exist in the archives, but argues that such a large plan must have been documented and assumes that they are missing, not that such planning did not occur. A lack of such documentary evidence earlier in his discussion of the Acomas might also merit such a reading.

Chapter 6, “The Pueblos’ Holy War, 1680s,” describes the Pueblo-Spanish war of this decade, mostly concentrated towards the beginning and end of these ten years. Often, attacks against the Spanish concluded with the destruction of the Spanish mission churches, including the large structure at Pecos. Spanish resettlement of these areas was led by Diego de Vargas who used a mix of military power and diplomacy among Pueblo leaders to restore a delicate co-existence between these groups. De Vargas’ resettlement is discussed further in Chapter 7, “Resettlement, 1690s.” The final push to restore the Spanish power to Santa Fe and the rest of the provinces involved a revitalized Spanish migration along with continued warfare. After some success,
De Vargas faced his own struggle to maintain power against the newly appointed governor, Pedro Rodríguez Cubero. After imprisonment and return to Mexico, De Vargas was re-appointed governor in 1703 but died soon after from illness after one final campaign against Apache cattle and horse rustlers. The war was seemingly settled, and, as before, the Spanish and Pecos people continued, in Kessell’s words, “to live together yet apart” (175).

The epilogue, “A Lifetime Later, 1760,” and the “Postscript” recount two later symbolic encounters between the Pecos and the Spaniards. The first is in 1760, when Bishop Pedro Tamarón y Romeral oversaw the confirmation of 192 Pecos Indians. Soon after, a Pecos man named Agustín Guichí created a burlesque of the incident, dressing up comically as the bishop and conducting services. Record recounts that afterwards, Guichí was attacked and killed by a bear, a sign, as the bishop interpreted, of God’s anger. The epilogue describes the more recent (1998) sawing off of the right foot of the twelve-foot high bronze statue of Juan de Oñate erected in Alcalde, New Mexico, and the dropping of Oñate’s name from the thirty-six foot tall statue The Equestrian which stands in El Paso, Texas. This is juxtaposed with the placing of the statue of Po’pay, one of the Pueblo leaders in the Pueblo-Spanish war, in the United States National Statuary Hall in Washington, D.C. Both leaders, Kessell argues, were involved in the dramatic and often cruel bloodshed of the war, and the memorialization should cause a re-examination of these atrocities. Kessell argues that such reflection should be done without assigning blame. Kessell’s engaging narrative is, in one sense, an attempt at exactly this type of examination. At times successful yet at others not, Kessell wants to speak for both sides through a reading of the documentary records, forgetting that in such accounts, as Gayatri Spivak reminds us, the subaltern cannot speak but is always spoken for.